The book focuses on the relational dynamic between "masters" and "natives" in the construction of scholarly narratives about the past, in the fields of archeology, history or the study of religions. The binomial opposition "masters and natives" is upsetting and unsettling. The formula's unease is intended: those words that carry a negative connotation point to the equivocal relations developed between archeologists working for world powers and local populations from countries that have often been labelled in bulk – and arbitrarily so – as "Oriental". Focusing on the agency of local actors, the book explores a type of relation that is highly ambiguous and constantly variable.

THE SERIES:

WELTEN SÜD- UND ZENTRALASIENS - WORLDS OF SOUTH AND INNER ASIA - MONDES DE L'ASIE DU SUD ET DE L'ASIE CENTRALE

The series Worlds of South and Inner Asia of the Swiss Asia Society publishes high-quality research on present-day and historical South and Inner Asian cultures and societies covering fields such as history, literature, philosophy, politics and arts, as well as interpretations and translations of primary sources. Furthermore the series presents studies focusing on current topics and affairs appealing not only to the academic public, but also to a public generally interested in South and Inner Asia. The series provides a forum for scholarly work in the fields of humanities and social sciences in Switzerland. However, the series is also committed to the rich variety of studies and writing on South and Inner Asia in the international research community. The principal languages of publication of monographs and anthologies are German, French and English. The series is supervised by an editorial board which is advised by leading scholars in the academic fields concerned.

Michel E. Fuchs, Claude Rapin (Eds., "MASTERS" AND "NATIVES"

Svetlana Gorshenina, Philippe Bornet, Michel E. Fuchs, Claude Rapin (Eds.)

"MASTERS" AND "NATIVES"

DIGGING THE OTHERS' PAST



WELTEN SÜD- UND ZENTRALASIENS WORLDS OF SOUTH AND INNER ASIA MONDES DE L'ASIE DU SUD ET DE L'ASIE CENTRALE



Welten Süd- und Zentralasiens – Worlds of South and Inner Asia – Mondes de l'Asie du Sud et de l'Asie Centrale

Im Auftrag der Schweizerischen Asiengesellschaft – On behalf of the Swiss Asia Society – Au nom de la Société Suisse-Asie

Edited by Blain H. Auer Maya Burger Karénina Kollmar-Paulenz Angelika Malinar Ingo Strauch

Volume 8

"Masters" and "Natives"

Digging the Others' Past

Edited by Svetlana Gorshenina, Philippe Bornet, Michel E. Fuchs, and Claude Rapin

DE GRUYTER

This publication was made possible due to the support of Swiss Academy of Humanities and Social Sciences (SAGW).

Schweizerische Akademie der Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaften
Académie suisse des sciences humaines et sociales
Accademia svizzera di scienze umane e sociali
Academia svizra da scienzas umanas e socialas
Swiss Academy of Humanities and Social Sciences



ISBN 978-3-11-059706-6 e-ISBN (PDF) 978-3-11-059946-6 e-ISBN (EPUB) 978-3-11-059712-7 ISSN 1661-775X

Library of Congress Control Number: 2019945625

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at http://dnb.dnb.de.

© 2019 Walter de Gruyter GmbH, Berlin/Boston Typesetting: Integra Software Services Pvt. Ltd. Printing and binding: CPI books GmbH, Leck

Cover image: Excavations of Vassily V. Vjatkin at Afrasiab. Sankt-Peterburgskij filial Arkhiva Rossijskoj Akademii nauk [St. Petersburg Branch of the Archive of the Russian Academy of Sciences], f. 68, op. 1, d. 65, ch. 3, l. 60.

www.degruyter.com

Contents

Acknowledgements --- V

Note on Transliteration - X

Alain Schnapp

Preface: Continuity and Distance: Antiquarians before

Archaeologists — 1

Svetlana Gorshenina, Philippe Bornet, Michel E. Fuchs and Claude Rapin Introduction: The Spirit of Adventure: The Archaeologist-cum-Hero and His Aides in the Heart of Unknown Worlds — 5

Archaeology in the Time of Empires: Unequal Negotiations and Scientific Competition

Karl Reber

"Masters" Against "Natives": Edward Daniel Clarke and the "Theft" of the Eleusinian "Goddess" —— 19

Svetlana Gorshenina

Russian Archaeologists, Colonial Administrators, and the "Natives" of Turkestan: Revisiting the History of Archaeology in Central Asia — 31

Mikhail Bukharin

The "Maîtres" of Archaeology in Eastern Turkestan: Divide et Impera — 87

"Master" / "Native": Are There Winners?

A Micro-History of Reciprocal and Non-Linear Relations

Rachel Mairs and Maya Muratov

Subverting the "Master"—"Native" Relationship: Dragomans and Their Clients in the Fin-de-Siècle Middle East —— 107

Barbara Kaim

In the Service of the Colonizer: Leon Barszczewski, Polish Officer in the Tsarist Army —— 121

Irina Arzhantseva and Heinrich Härke
"The General and his Army": Metropolitans and Locals
on the Khorezmian Expedition —— 137

Taming the Other's Past: The Eurocentric Scientific Tools

Philippe Bornet

From the Emic to the Etic and Back Again: Archaeology, Orientalism, and Religion from Colonial Sri Lanka to Switzerland —— 177

Himanshu Prabha Ray

Legislation and the Study of the Past: The Archaeological Survey of India and Challenges of the Present —— 197

Luca Maria Olivieri

Early Archaeology in a "Native State": Khans, Officers, and Archaeologists in Swat (1895–1939), with a Digression on the 1950s —— 213

The Forging of Myths: Heroic Clichés and the (Re-) Distribution of Roles

Leonid Heller

Archaeologists in Soviet Literature — 239

Mehdi Derfoufi

Archaeology and the Archaeologist on Screen — 255

Reversal of Roles in Postcolonial and Neocolonial Contexts: From a Relation between "Masters" and "Subordinates" to "Partnership"?

Agnès Borde Meyer

From Supervision to Independence in Archaeology: The Comparison of the Iranian and the Afghan Strategy —— 291

Arnaud Nanta

The Postcolonial Rewriting of the Past in North and South Korea Following Independence (1950s-1960s) — 307

Bruno Genito

Excavating in Iran and Central Asia: Cooperation or Competition? —— 323

Claude Rapin

Publishing an Archaeological Discovery astride the "North"-"South" Divide (On an Example from Central Asia) —— 343

Thierry Luginbühl

Role Reversal: Hindu "Ethno-Expertise" of Western Archaeological

Materials — 367